



City of Santa Barbara

Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, December 4, 2013

David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street

1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

PHILIP SUDING, *Chair*
DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair*
LOUISE BOUCHER
MICHAEL DRURY
WILLIAM LA VOIE
FERMINA MURRAY
JUDY ORÍAS
CRAIG SHALLANBERGER
BARRY WINICK

ADVISORY MEMBER:

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:

DALE FRANCISCO

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:

SHEILA LODGE

STAFF:

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor / Historic Preservation Supervisor
NICOLE HERNÁNDEZ, Urban Historian
SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician
GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

An archived video copy of this regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission is viewable on computers with high speed internet access on the City website at www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc and then clicking on the Videos under Explore.

CALL TO ORDER:

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 1:32 p.m. by Chair Suding.

ATTENDANCE:

Members present: Drury, Murray, Orías, Shallenberger (at 1:37 p.m.), Sharpe, Suding (until 4:08 p.m. and again at 4:11 p.m.), and Winick.
Members absent: Boucher/La Voie.
Staff present: Hernández, Gantz and Feliciano.

GENERAL BUSINESS:

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of previous meeting minutes.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of November 20, 2013, with an amendment.

Action: Sharpe/Drury, 6/0/1. (Boucher/La Voie absent. Shallenberger abstained.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Donald Sharpe.

Action: Winick/Murray, 7/0/0. (Boucher/La Voie absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Ms. Gantz announced that Commissioners Boucher and La Voie would be absent from the meeting.
2. Ms. Hernández reported that a 60-day public notice has been sent to property owners for buildings/sites that have been found to be eligible to be listed on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources based on the results of the Lower Riviera Survey completed by Post/Hazeltine including individually eligible buildings as well as contributing buildings within the proposed historic districts of Mission Gardens and Plaza Bonita. Individually eligible structures in the Waterfront area and several other buildings in the city that were found to have potential historic significance were also included in the notice. The HLC public hearing to discuss these properties will be held on January 29, 2014.
3. Commissioner Orías announced that the Planning Commission would be discussing changes to the fences and hedges ordinance that could affect historic resources under the HLC's purview. Bettie Weiss, City Planner, responded that at the Planning Commission meeting of December 12, 2013, the discussion with respect to the Fence, Screens, Walls and Hedges Ordinance (SBMC §28.87.170), will address concerns regarding the proposed ordinance amendments. The second meeting, during which formal recommendations will be made by the Planning Commission, will be held the following week on December 19. It will then be sent to the Ordinance Committee in 2014 before going to City Council.

A discussion was held with the Single Family Design Board since the ordinance would apply mainly to that board. Staff will now plan a discussion with the HLC at its next meeting as well.

4. Ms. Weiss announced that a Planning Commission meeting to discuss the Average-Unit Size Density Incentive Program will be held on December 12, 2013, at which time a recommendation will be forwarded to the City Council.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

No subcommittee reports.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING**1. 608 & 614 CHAPALA ST**

C-M Zone

(1:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-131-020
Application Number: MST2013-00397
Owner: Figueroa Investors, Ltd.
Architect: elevenModern

(Proposal to infill 5,121 square feet under an existing roof area attached to a 20,579 square foot commercial building and to add a 187 square foot restroom addition to an existing 459 square foot detached commercial building. No change in use is proposed and no grading is required. This parcel is in the 50% parking Zone of Benefit and the parking requirement is 27 spaces, with 36 proposed. Total development on this 42,972 square foot parcel will be 27,762 square feet. This project requires Planning Commission review for a Development Plan. This building is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources and is included in the State Historic Resources Inventory: "Former C & H Chevrolet constructed in 1946.")

(Project requires Environmental Assessment, Compatibility Criteria Analysis, and Planning Commission review.)

Actual time: 1:46 p.m.

Present: John Beauchamp, Architect, elevenModern
Kip Bradley, Representing Ownership
Kelly Brodison, Assistant Planner

Public comment opened at 1:57 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on the proposed use of the property and whether it can be made to fit into the El Pueblo Viejo Guidelines.

Public comment closed at 1:59 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Planning Commission with positive comments:

1. Design Review:

- a. The Commission appreciates the adaptive reuse of the building.
- b. Identify the existing tree on the plans.
- c. Add trees to the parking lot.
- d. Explore restoring the corner of the front building at the northwest corner.
- e. Screen the mechanical roof equipment.
- f. Enhance the addition to the small building.
- g. Look at improvements to the building holistically.
- h. Improvements must benefit the site long-term, since changes to the building remain, while the current tenant will not be permanent.
- i. Use quality windows.
- j. The awning should not span over the pilasters.
- k. Consider changing the slope of the awning, eliminating the awning and its configuration.

2. The Commission has reviewed the proposed project and Compatibility Analysis Criteria have been generally met for this project (per SBMC 22.22.145.B. and 22.68.045.B.) as follows:

- a. The proposed development project's design complies with all City Regulations and the integrity of the existing building is consistent with El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District Guidelines.
- b. The proposed design is compatible with the distinctive architectural character of Santa Barbara and of the particular Neighborhood surrounding the project.
- c. The size, mass, bulk, height, and scale of the proposed development are appropriate for its neighborhood as the heights are not proposed to be increased.
- d. The design of the proposed development is appropriately sensitive to adjacent City Landmark/designated historic resources, historic sites or natural features and mitigation measures are adequate to reduce adverse impacts.
- e. Review for public views of ocean and mountains are not applicable.
- f. Review for appropriate amount of open space and landscaping are not applicable during conceptual review of the project.
- g. Carry forward the HLC comments to the Planning Commission.

Action: Shallanberger/Drury, 7/0/0. (Boucher/La Voie absent.) Motion carried.

DISCUSSION ITEM

2. PLAZA DE VERA CRUZ

P-R Zone

(2:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-201-004
 Application Number: MST2013-00491
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Cameron Benson, Creeks Manager

(Proposal to replace the existing impermeable asphalt alley paving with permeable pavers to comply with the City's Storm Water Management Program. The proposed project area is approximately 10,000 square feet. This park is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Plaza de Vera Cruz, one of the city's original parks.")

(Comments only.)

Actual time: 2:42 p.m.

Present: Cameron Benson, Creeks Resources/Clean Water Manager, Parks and Recreation
 Tim Burgess, Water Resources Specialist, Parks and Recreation
 Laura Yanez, Project Engineer, Public Works

Staff comments: Mr. Benson stated that proposed demonstration projects include alleyways, sidewalks and streets for stormwater quality and urban run-off/water quality improvements. The goal is to restore some of the natural hydrology in the area. This project involves an asphalt alleyway running along the western edge of the park area.

Public comment opened at 2:48 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on whether an archeological report would be needed.

Public comment closed at 2:50 p.m.

Staff responded to public comment that the area has been excavated previously and no further depth is proposed; therefore, the preparation of an archaeological report is not required.

The Commission made the following comments:

1. Historic Resource Findings can be made since the installation of the permeable pavers in this location will not cause a substantial adverse change in the significance of the historical resource.
2. Provide color samples. The grey color ranges are more acceptable/compatible within El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District.
3. The Commission would like to see both the gap and gapless systems.
(Boucher/La Voie absent.)

**** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:04 PM TO 3:13 PM ****

DISCUSSION ITEM**3. 1200 BLK LAGUNA ALLEY**

(2:50) Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-003-167
Application Number: MST2013-00492
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: Cameron Benson, Creeks Manager

(Proposal to replace the existing impermeable asphalt alley paving with permeable pavers to comply with the City's Storm Water Management Program. The proposed project area is approximately 5,000 square feet.)

(Comments only.)

Actual time: 3:13 p.m.

Present: Cameron Benson, Creeks Resources/Clean Water Manager, Parks and Recreation
Tim Burgess, Water Resources Specialist, Parks and Recreation
Laura Yanez, Project Engineer, Public Works

Staff comments: Mr. Benson stated that proposed demonstration projects include alleyways, sidewalks and streets for stormwater quality and urban run-off/water quality improvements. The goal is to restore some of the natural hydrology in the area.

Public comment opened at 3:15 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, inquired as to who it serves and who owns it.

Michael Gones, adjacent resident, spoke in support of the project and commented that it should be less industrial and more "romantic." (He provided renderings of a suggested "green" alley/pedestrian way design.)

Public comment closed at 3:20 p.m.

Staff responded to public comment that this is a public alleyway; therefore, the City is responsible for its construction and maintenance. There are private residences on both sides of the alley.

The Commission made the following comments:

1. The design of this location needs to be enhanced and considerate/respectful of the significant historic resources in the area.
2. Provide a landscape-hardscape design with aesthetic value that provides variation and visual enhancement.
3. The Commission recommends that the applicant meet with neighbors for a constructive discussion. (Boucher/La Voie absent.)

DISCUSSION ITEM**4. 0 BLK ARLINGTON AVE**

(3:10) Assessor's Parcel Number: ROW-001-345
 Application Number: MST2013-00493
 Owner: City of Santa Barbara
 Applicant: Cameron Benson, Creeks Manager

(Proposal to replace the existing impermeable asphalt street surface and concrete sidewalks on Arlington Avenue with permeable pavers to comply with the City's Storm Water Management Program. The proposed project area is approximately 23,500 square feet.)

(Comments only.)

Actual time: 3:39 p.m.

Present: Cameron Benson, Creeks Resources/Clean Water Manager, Parks and Recreation
 Tim Burgess, Water Resources Specialist, Parks and Recreation
 Laura Yanez, Project Engineer, Public Works

Staff comments: Mr. Benson stated that proposed demonstration projects include alleyways, sidewalks and streets for stormwater quality and urban run-off/water quality improvements. The goal is to restore some of the natural hydrology in the area. The demonstrations involve different types of hardscape. Other sites for this particular project were ruled out for various reasons.

Public comment opened at 3:44 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on this street being heavily used by the public and the circulation/parking problem in the area, and questioned why this street was chosen for this project.

Public comment closed at 3:48 p.m.

Staff responded to public comment that the applicant is aware of the heavy traffic and parking needs in this area. Staff plans an extensive outreach with neighbors and property owners to address any concerns/issues. This is a demonstration project that would be visible and may be the only suitable location within El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District that is relatively level.

The Commission made the following comments:

1. The concept of a demonstration project on a City street is supportable and the Commission hopes the applicant continues to pursue a suitable project area for permeable concrete paver installation in the City. This is the entranceway leading to the Arlington Theater; therefore, this location may or may not be a suitable location for concrete pavers.
2. The extent of concrete pavers, as proposed, is not supportable given the project's proximity to the Arlington Theater. Consider an alternate design using less concrete pavers. A higher level of design is needed for the Commission to possibly support concrete pavers in this location.
3. Re-examine the E. Anapamu Street corridor between Garden and Milpas Streets as a means to help preserve and nourish the landmarked Italian Stone Pines.
(Boucher/La Voie absent.)

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**5. 515 STATE ST**

C-M Zone

(3:30) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-172-006
 Application Number: MST2013-00478
 Owner: Ray Mahboob
 Architect: DMHA

(Proposal for a legal change of use and alterations to the State Street elevation including recessing the doors and windows to their original built location. This will result in a credit of 461 square feet of floor area. Also proposed is to reconstruct an enclosed loading dock at the rear elevation and add 16 square feet of floor area, construct a new trash enclosure, and restripe the existing parking lot where eight parking spaces are required but 16 parking spaces are being proposed. The total net credit of non-residential floor area is 445 square feet. This is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "Automotive and Machine Shop, L.N. Diedrich Building.")

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Actual time: 4:08 p.m.

Present: Henry Lenny, Architect, Henry Lenny Design Studio, Inc.
 Edward DeVicente, Architect, DMHA

Public comment opened at 4:25 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, questioned whether a screen or gate for security has been proposed.

Public comment closed at 4:26 p.m.

Chair Suding responded to public comment that there are no gates across the arcade.

Motion: Project Design and Final Approvals and final details continued two weeks to the Consent Calendar with conditions:

1. The Commission continues to appreciate the owners' commitment to restore the building and arcade.
2. The single-hung windows are a good solution to the bar opening.
3. Resolve the single-hung windows with the mullions of the upper windows when the lower windows are opened, if necessary.
4. Use a more historic finish on the bar stool bases than the proposed polished chrome.
5. If the mechanical equipment gets any larger than shown, provide screening.

Action: Shallanberger/Orías, 7/0/0. (Boucher/La Voie absent.) Motion carried.

CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00)

PROJECT DESIGN AND FINAL REVIEW

A. 220 E PUEBLO ST

E-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-202-002
 Application Number: MST2013-00346
 Owner: Jane Martindale Living Trust
 Architect: Fred Sweeney, Architect

(Proposal for a minor ground floor addition and alterations to an existing one-story 1,381 square foot single-family residence. The project includes the demolition of 16 square feet of bathroom floor area and construction of a new 58 square foot bathroom, and a second new bathroom of 56 square feet. Also proposed is a new 5'-0" wide porch on the south elevation and a new 12 square foot water heater enclosure. The existing 133 square foot detached shed and attached one-car carport will remain unaltered. There will be approximately eight to ten cubic yards of foundation grading. The floor-to-lot-area ratio (FAR) on this 10,762 square foot parcel will be 0.139. This project received Staff Hearing Officer approval of a zoning modification. This is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources as eligible for Structure of Merit status: "Constructed in 1906, former art studio of Lyla Marshall Harcoff and renovated by noted architect Lutah Maria Riggs.")

(Requires compliance with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 061-13. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)

Project Design and Final Approvals as submitted.

**** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:33 P.M.
 TO THE DONALD SHARPE FAMILY RESIDENCE HOLIDAY PARTY
 ON DECEMBER 15, 2013 ****